### CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

**TO:** Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)

**FROM:** Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Planner

**DATE:** November 10, 2021

**SUBJECT:** CoA 21-27, 3313 22<sup>nd</sup> St North, Maywood Local Historic District

### **Background Information**

The Maywood National Register Nomination describes the contributing dwelling at 3313 22<sup>nd</sup> St North as the following:

The two-bay-wide. wood-frame dwelling rests on a solid parged foundation. It is stuccoed and has a gable-roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. It has a one-story, two-bay, wood-frame front porch on round turned posts and one-over-one wood-sash windows. Window and door surrounds are unmitered wood with a projecting sill and molded lintel. Other notable features include sawn brackets on the porch, a diamond-paned window on the east elevation. and a one-story addition to the rear.

A rear one-story addition with a front porch matching that on the original dwelling was approved by the HALRB in 1996 and constructed in 1997.

# **Proposal**

The applicant is requesting to modify the existing dwelling by adding a second story to the existing non-historic one-story addition on the rear of the property, add a dormer to the original dwelling and remove an existing chimney stack.

The second story would be clad in Hardie bead board with wooden one-over-one sash windows similar to the 2008-era windows in the addition. The current addition has a front porch with turned posts matching those on the original dwelling and the owner proposes to replace them with 5.5" square wooden posts, with trim at the base where it meets the porch floor. The applicant proposes to install French doors in the rear with a small overhang and a new patio roughly 196 s.f. roughly 8" above grade.

The applicant also proposes to install a dormer in the west elevation of the original dwelling to allow access to the attic. It would have lap siding and four wooden windows with similar profiles to the existing windows at the attic level.

# **DRC Review**

The DRC considered this item at the October 2021 virtual meeting. Mr. Davis thought the band on the eastern portion of the design (that wrapped around the center) should either be eliminated or brought around the entire 2<sup>nd</sup>-story addition (all the way to the west). Mr. Dudka agreed. Mr. Wenchel believed that the porch should not be recessed under the house but have its own roof. Mr. Dudka voiced concern about the functionality of the porch and recommended expanding the depth to a minimum of 5'and preferably 7' for a usable space. He also recommended improving the appearance of the supports to make them appear more functional and that square columns would be acceptable. Mr. Dudka and Mr. Wenchel agreed the notch in the building should be filled in. Mr. Dudka felt that the lack of fenestration needed to be addressed.

Since the DRC meeting the applicant applied the following changes based on the feedback:

- 1. Removed the banding between 1st and 2nd floor and added a window to the east elevation;
- 2. Set back the second floor addition to be in same plane as first floor (no longer extending over side porch)
- 3. Porch depth increased to 5' and columns simplified to improve side porch relationship to the house and increased functionality.

### Recommendation

Historic Preservation Program staff recommends approval of the project as proposed. The two-story addition is an improvement to the current design, whose columns and height read as a cottage behind the main dwelling. Second story additions to existing non-historic additions have been approved in Maywood in the past, most recently at 2353 North Edgewood (CoA 17-05). The proposed square column indicates more readily that the addition is non-historic which would meet the intent of Standard #9 of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

Standard #9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The applicant responded to DRC feedback, setting the addition back, adding fenestration, simplifying the column and adding a roof to the porch.

The materials proposed-Hardie bead siding, wooden windows, asphalt shingles, wooden trim and wood columns- are appropriate per the *Maywood Design Guidelines*, have been used in Maywood in the past, and also conform with Standard #9 of the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed new dormer on the main dwelling. The addition of dormers in this location has been approved by the HALRB in the Maywood LHD in the past (CoA 21-07 at 3501 21<sup>st</sup> Ave and CoA 03-23 at 3623 22<sup>nd</sup> St. N.). The *Maywood Design Guidelines* indicate that the use of dormers is a more traditional way to add space, and the proposed construction of additional dormers would be a more appropriate way to convert the attic into usable living space than to construct an addition or raise the roof.

Staff recommends approval of the removal of the existing chimney stack. The HALRB has approved the removal of disused chimney stacks when they are not considered character defining features of a building's appearance (most recently in CoA 18-04 at 2330 North Jackson Street).