CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)

FROM: Mical Tawney, Historic Preservation Associate Planner

DATE: February 12, 2024

SUBJECT: CoA 24-05, 3310 21st Ave. N., Maywood Local Historic District (LHD)

Background Information

The *Maywood National Register Nomination* describes the pre-1923 contributing dwelling at 3310 21st Avenue N. as follows:

The two-bay-wide, wood-frame dwelling rests on a solid parged foundation. It is clad in simulated-brick siding and has a cross-gable roof sheathed in standing-seam metal. It has a one-story, two-bay, wood-frame front porch on molded square posts and six-over-six wood-sash windows. Window and door surrounds are unmittered with a projecting sill and cyma lintel. Other notable features include simulated half-timbering in the gable end, a molded wood cornice, and a front entry with a single-light transom and board-and-batten wood shutters.

Between February 2008 and June 2009, the HALRB reviewed and approved projects associated with the construction of a two-story rear addition and back patio. In March 2011, staff approved ACoA 11-04 for the removal of a dying tree located jointly between 3310 and 3312 21st Avenue N.

Proposal

The applicant is proposing to construct an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) in the rear yard. This would require the removal of a circa 2009 shed on grade, as well as the removal of a small portion of the existing rear patio. The proposed one-story ADU will be 459 s.f. and feature a rectangular floor plan with a side-gable roof. Proposed materials include Hardieplank siding, GAF three-tab asphalt roof shingles, PVC trim, Andersen vinyl-clad, simulated-divided-lite (SDL) wood windows (fixed, awning, and double-hung-sash), and an Andersen aluminum-clad wood double-leaf patio door. A small condenser unit will be situated along the west elevation of the ADU.

The applicant also proposes to change the size and material of the existing driveway. The driveway would be reduced to 336 s.f. (14' wide by 24' long) and the asphalt would be replaced with permeable pavers.

Design Review Committee (DRC) Review

The DRC considered this application at its February 7, 2024, hybrid meeting. Mr. Davis asked for clarification about the material proposed at the base of the ADU; the applicant confirmed it would be PVC. Mr. Wenchel stated that the proposal was appropriate for the LHD because the ADU would be

situated at the rear of the property and not be visible from the public right-of-way. He appreciated that it was of new construction and an honest expression of an accessory building.

Ms. Tawney asked about the PVC trim thickness, and it was confirmed that what was proposed would conform with the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. Ms. Liccese-Torres asked if there was a planned pathway between the ADU and the driveway; the applicant confirmed there was not. Mr. Davis said he felt the Hardieplank and PVC trim were appropriate in this case given the building would be new construction, but he wanted the HALRB to discuss whether the proposed fenestration materials are appropriate for secondary buildings in Maywood. The DRC members placed this item on the Discussion Agenda for the February 21, 2024, hybrid HALRB public hearing.

Recommendation

The Historic Preservation Program (HPP) staff recommends approval of this application as submitted. The removal of the modern shed to construct the ADU does not need a CoA because the shed does not have a foundation. The ADU will not be highly visible from the right-of-way and the proposed location allows it to be secondary to the primary dwelling, which complies with Appendix G of the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. Furthermore, the proposed design is compatible with the architectural context of the historic district and meets the intent of Chapter 6: New Addition/Building of the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. The creation of ADUs has been determined by the HALRB as appropriate for the LHD in the past; the HALRB approved a new ADU at 2314 N. Kenmore St. (CoA 19-16) and at 3504 21st Ave. N. via (CoA 20-20) (note the latter was never constructed).

Regarding the materials proposed, most are considered appropriate for Maywood. The Hardieplank siding, asphalt shingle roof, and PVC trim are all appropriate materials per Appendix C, D, and G of the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. Vinyl-clad windows are not appropriate for the district per Chapter 5: Exterior Alterations of the *Maywood Design Guidelines* (pg. 19); however, it should be noted that Chapter 5 largely pertains to the main houses of Maywood rather than outbuildings or accessory buildings. For comparison, the proposed ADU at 3504 21st Ave. N. was approved for vinyl-clad windows and the ADU at 2314 N. Kenmore St. has wood windows.

While an ADU is not a shed or a garage, it is an accessory dwelling and Appendix G offers guidance for both types of structures. According to Appendix G, sheds in the LHD are permitted to have wood, aluminum-clad, or vinyl windows and garages are permitted to have wood windows. Regarding doors, wood doors have typically been found to be most appropriate for Maywood; both approved ADU applications in the past included wood doors. The current proposal includes an aluminum-clad wood door. Appendix G allows for sheds to have either wood, steel, or fiberglass doors and garages to have wood doors. Staff encourages the HALRB to discuss the proposed materials for the windows and doors in the subject application to determine their appropriateness for the district. The HPP staff finds that the use of non-wood materials would not be inappropriate in this specific case.

Finally, the HPP staff also finds the proposed changes in size and material of the driveway to be appropriate for the LHD. It should be noted that this aspect of the project could have been approved administratively, but the size of the driveway was too large to approve via ACoA (Appendix G only allows staff to approve driveways of 10' or less in size).